ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives (CHI): Planning for Safeguarding Heritage Sites in Syria and Iraq


Michael D. Danti, Cheikhmous Ali, and Abdalrazzaq Moaz

Key Points

• In Syria, there is increasing evidence surfacing of ISIL deliberate destructions of religious heritage places carried out in December 2014, such as the Tomb of Abed al-Qader Bek al-Azm ibn Ahmed Mouayd (d. 1920) in Rif Dimashq (ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-004) and the Bir al-Qasr Sufi shrine (ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-011). Other extremist organizations are following suit and increasing their attacks on religious heritage deemed inappropriate. (pp. 9–12, 53–55)

• In Syria, on January 16, 2015 Jabhat Ansar al-Din, other Islamist extremists, and local officials destroyed the tombs of the highly influential religious scholar and political activist Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan (1900–1974) and his family and exhumed their skeletal remains for relocation. The tombs are situated in the vicinity of the al-Keltawia Mosque (the historic Madrasa al-Atabakiya) in the Bab al-Hadid area of the Old City of Aleppo. ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-009. (pp. 28–34)

• Ross Burns’ Monuments of Syria website has posted a detailed and updated report on heritage damage http://monumentsofsyria.com/syria-conflict/attachment/syria-damage-list-jan-2015-2/

• On January 9, 2015 the Harakat ‘Ahrar al-Sham militia of the Islamic Front in Aleppo allegedly deliberately targeted the Armenian Cathedral (St. Rita Cathedral in the al-Tallal District), hitting it multiple times with mortar fire and inflicting structural damage on the church. ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-006. (pp. 15–20)

• Numerous unconfirmed reports have been circulating since December 2014 of ISIL deliberate destructions of heritage in Mosul as well as rampant looting of cultural property and markedly increased extortion (“taxation”).

Heritage Timeline

January 19, 2015 Haberler.com reported on the seizure by police of a large collection of ancient coins (147 gold coins) and 71 other antiquities in the town of Reyhanli in the Turkish Hatay, including items of the Roman and Abbasid periods.

1 This report is based on research conducted by the “Syria Preservation Initiative: Planning for Safeguarding Heritage Sites in Syria.” Weekly reports reflect reporting from a variety of sources and may contain unverified material. As such, they should be treated as preliminary and subject to change.
January 18, 2015

The Judicial Office of the Sharia Court in Aleppo issued a statement clarifying its participation in the destruction of the Sufi Tomb of Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan and his family members and the exhumation of their physical remains amid a growing controversy. ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-009.

http://www.facebook.com/HalabTodayTV/photos/a.422583204425790.121836.353338088016969/1068803703137067/?type=1

January 16, 2015

Jabhat Ansar al-Din, Islamic Front, Jabhat al-Nusra, and representatives of the Commission for the Promotion of Virtue and Prevention of Vice, destroyed the Sufi Tomb of Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan and his family near the al-Keltawia Mosque (Madrasa al-Atabakiyya) in the Bab al-Hadid area of the Old City of Aleppo. The group conducted this activity with a signed decree from the Head of the Aleppo Sharia Court and other offices dated January 15, 2014. ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-009.

http://www.mojez.com/News/Channels/62/1723212/%E2%80%AB


Ankawa reported that ISIL militants in Mosul executed two people for hiding Christian properties from ISIL, which are considered ghanima or spoils and must be surrendered to ISIL.

http://english.ankawa.com/?p=13611

Ankawa reported that ISIL militants allegedly burned historical books and Christian manuscripts in the Mosul neighborhood of “Almajmoaa Althaqafia” on January 13, 2015. The manuscripts were allegedly from the Mar Afram, Mar Paul, and Our Lady of the Annunciation churches.

http://english.ankawa.com/?p=13613

APSA posted a report on combat damage to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in the UNESCO World Heritage Site, Ancient City of Aleppo. ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-010.


January 15, 2014  
DGAM posted a report on widespread looting in Daraa Governorate, mentioning eight sites. [ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-008.](http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1568)

January 14, 2014  

•  

January 13, 2015  

January 12, 2105  
*Ankawa* reported that ISIL allegedly plans to destroy the walls of ancient Nineveh if the Iraqi Army attacks. Several other media outlets have posted similar stories. [http://english.ankawa.com/?p=13581](http://english.ankawa.com/?p=13581)

January 9, 2015  

January 8, 2014  
A barrel bomb fell in the Kazasker Cemetery in Aleppo causing severe damage. [ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-005.](http://rudaw.net/english/middleeast/iraq/261220142)

January 5, 2014  
*Xendan* reported that ISIL ordered the evacuation of ten historic mosques in Mosul so that they could be destroyed. [http://www.xendan.org/arabic/drejaa.aspx?Jmara=8543](http://www.xendan.org/arabic/drejaa.aspx?Jmara=8543)

December 30, 2014  
ISIL is rumored to have deliberately destroyed the Mashhad of Imam Muhsin (Madrasa al-Nuriya) in Mosul. This remains **unconfirmed**.

December 26, 2014  
*Rudaw* alleged that ISIL had blown up the Church of the Virgin Mary in Mosul. This incident is **unconfirmed**. The accompanying photos show an earlier destruction of a different site. [http://rudaw.net/english/middleeast/iraq/261220142](http://rudaw.net/english/middleeast/iraq/261220142)

December 22, 2014  

December 12, 2014  
December 8, 2014  

**Gola Press** (Persian language press) and other media outlets as well as ISIL linked social media sites and websites posted images (photos by ABNA.ir) and stories of ISIL **destructions of graves** in the town of Al-Tabqa in Syria's Raqqa Governorate. Persian language press included information on an ISIL “liquidation battalion” numbering 300 men with heavy machinery assigned to destroy heritage places deemed *shirk*. ASOR SHI Incident Report SHI 15-003.  
http://golpapress.com/world-sport/item/669
https://www.facebook.com/hbmalshaar3?fref=photo

**Military and Political Context**

Due to the magnitude of heritage incident reporting, there is no military and political update this week.

**Key Heritage Recommendations and Actions**

1) There has been an increase in the deliberate destruction of religious heritage across Syria (and reportedly in northern Iraq) by Islamist extremists. The number of extremist groups engaged in publicized destructions has risen, and the geographic distribution of destructions has expanded with a notable increase in southern Syria.

*ASOR CHI is doubling its efforts to document these destructions as well as investigate multiple lines of causality for these destructions and their promotion in news media, including ideological, economic, and political motivations.*
SHI 15-003

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Al Tabqa Cemetery

Date of Incident: Unspecified 2014

Location: Al Tabqa, Raqqa Governorate

Coordinates:

Site Description: A cemetery in the vicinity of the town of al-Thawra. The graves are modern.

Site Date: Modern heritage place.

Source of Destruction: ISIL deliberate destruction of graves deemed inappropriate (shirk) to Islam. The photos from the destruction were used by ISIL on their websites and affiliated social media.

Pattern: ISIL deliberate destruction.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: —

Sources:

Online Reporting:
Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/hbmalshaar3?fref=photo

Scholarly:
ISIL destroying modern graves in Al Tabqa (Gola Press).
ISIL destroying modern graves in Al Tabqa (Gola Press).

ISIL destroying modern graves in Al Tabqa (Gola Press)
ISIL destroying modern graves in Al Tabqa (Gola Press).
SHI 15-004

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Tomb of Abed al-Qader Bek al-Azm ibn Ahmed Mouayd Pasha

Date of Incident: December 12, 2014

Location: Undetermined in Rif Dimashq Governorate outside Damascus.

Coordinates: —

Site Description: The cemetery is located in Rif Dimashq.

Site Date: Abed al-Qader Bek al-Azm ibn Ahmed Mouayd Pasha died in 1920.

Source of Destruction: ISIL deliberate destruction.

Pattern: ISIL deliberate destruction of graves deemed inappropriate (shirk) to Islam. The photos from the destruction were used by ISIL on their websites and affiliated social media.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: —

Sources:

Online Reporting:

Scholarly:
ISIL destroying the Tomb of Abed al-Qader Bek al-Azm ibn Ahmed Mouayd Pasha in Rif Dimashq (APSA).
ISIL destroying the Tomb of Abed al-Qader Bek al-Azm ibn Ahmed Mouayd Pasha in Rif Dimashq (APSA).
ISIL burning of a flag at the Tomb of Abed al-Qader Bek al-Azm ibn Ahmed Mouayd Pasha in Rif Dimashq (APSA).
SHI 15-005

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Kazasker Cemetery, Aleppo

Date of Incident: January 8, 2014

Location: Aleppo

Coordinates: —

Site Description: A modern cemetery located in the city limits of Aleppo.

Site Date: Modern and probably earlier Muslim graves.

Source of Destruction: SARG barrel bomb.

Pattern: SARG barrel bomb destruction in Aleppo and other cities in Syria.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: —

Sources:

Online Reporting:
Mojez.com (Aleppo Today):
http://www.mojez.com/News/Channels/62/1680812/%E2%80%AB

Scholarly:
Barrel bomb damage in the Kazasker Cemetery in Aleppo.
SHI 15-006

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Armenian Catholic Cathedral Our Lady of Pity/ St. Rita Cathedral

Date of Incident: January 9, 2015

Location: The al-Tallal area of Aleppo

Coordinates:

Site Description: Located on Al-Tallal Street in Aleppo next to the Armenian Catholic Eparchy of Aleppo.

Site Date: Consecrated 1840

Source of Destruction: On January 9, 2015 the Harakat ‘Ahrar al-Sham militia of the Islamic Front in Aleppo allegedly deliberately targeted the Armenian Cathedral (St. Rita Cathedral in the al-Tallal District), hitting it multiple times with mortar fire and inflicting severe damage to the structure.

Pattern: Deliberate targeting of religious heritage by militants.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: —

Sources:

Online Reporting:
Armenian Weekly: http://armenianweekly.com/2015/01/10/cathedral-bombed/

Scholarly:
Damage to the dome of the Armenian Catholic Cathedral Our Lady of Pity in Aleppo caused by mortar fire (Venus Studio).
Damage to the interior of the Armenian Catholic Cathedral Our Lady of Pity in Aleppo caused by mortar fire (Venus Studio).
The remains of a “mortar round” fired at the Armenian Catholic Cathedral Our Lady of Pity in Aleppo (Venus Media).
Damage to the dome of the Armenian Catholic Cathedral Our Lady of Pity in Aleppo caused by mortar fire (Venus Studio).
Damage to the interior of the Armenian Catholic Cathedral Our Lady of Pity in Aleppo caused by mortar fire (Venus Studio).
SHI 15-007

**Report Date:** January 18, 2015

**Site Name:** Qalaat Najm See also SHI 14-065

**Date of Incident:** Reported by DGAM January 14, 2015

**Location:** Aleppo Governorate on the right bank of the Euphrates near modern...

**Coordinates:**

**Site Description:** According to Ross Burns,

The existing remains largely date from the 13th century rebuilding of the fortress erected earlier by Nur al-Din (r 1146-74) who in turn had reconstructed an earlier fortress. The plan largely reflects the concepts of Arab military architecture realized from 1208 to 1215 by al-Zaher Ghazi...The castle takes full advantage of the existing highpoint in the terrain. The rocky crag is in itself a natural defense, towering steeply above the river plain. On the river side, a cladding of dressed stone provides an effective glacis and two towers further discourage scaling of the heights and defend the entrance gateway. Above the entrance, an Arabic inscription pays tribute to the work of Ghazi.

A great vaulted central passage leads up from the gateway with chambers on either side. The castle spreads over a series of these underground rooms and passageways (some reputedly giving secret access to the river) and two upper floors. Some pattern to the chambers and battlements on top of the mound is gradually emerging from the reconstruction. Remains include a small palace with a central courtyard with iwans and a mosque.\(^2\)

**Site Date:** Primarily 13\(^\text{th}\) century C.E.

**Source of Destruction:** Aleppo Antiquities Department reported to the DGAM that digging and illegal excavation at the site by “armed gang specialized in antiquities digging.” Specifically, the looters were digging “at the right side of the castle by using the bulldozers searching for treasures.” Other digging in the area of the castle has also been reported.

**Pattern:** Increased looting during the conflict. Looting in areas controlled by extremist organizations.

**Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures:** —

**Sources:**

Online Reporting:

---

DGAM: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1566

Scholarly:


Qalaat Najm (DGAM).
SHI 15-008

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Daraa Governorate Sites

Date of Incident: Unspecified. DGAM reported the looting January 15, 2015.

Location: The sites of Tell al-Ash’ari, Tell Umm Horan, Tell Ashtara, Tell al-Samn, Tell al-Hara, Tell al-Jmou, Tell al-Beit Akar, Tel al-Shihab.

Coordinates: Various

Site Description: Various archaeological mounds in the region.

Tell al-Umm Horan: “Located 2 km north of Nawa, the archaeological evidence dated to the 3rd century AD.”

Tell Ashtara: “Located near al-Shaykh Saad village, dating to the Bronze era.”

Tell al-Samn: “Located 5 km north of Tafas, it was mentioned in the Egyptian archives.”

Tell al-Hara: “One of the highest natural peaks in Dara’a, dating back to more than two thousand years at least.”

Tell al-Jmou: “Located west to Nawa.”

Tell al-Beit Akar: “Located 35 km west to Dara’a, on the edges of the Yarmouk Valley.”

Tell al-Shihab: “Located northwest to Dara’a, the archaeological evidence in the tell indicates the presence of an ancient civilization dating back to the Neolithic period around the eighth millennium BC.”

Site Dates: Various

Source of Destruction: Looting and illegal excavations by “armed gangs” who are allegedly bulldozing sites.

Pattern: Heavy looting since 2014 in Daraa Governorate.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: —

Sources:
Online Reporting:

Scholarly:
Tell al-Hara in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).

Tell al-Ashtara in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).
Tell al-Beit Akar in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).

Tell al-Jmou in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).
Tell al-Semn in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).

Tell al-Shihab in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).

Tell al-Umm Joran in Daraa Governorate (DGAM).
Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Tomb of [Sufi] Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan, Jami’ al-Kiltawiyya (Madrasa al-Atabikiyya)

Date of Incident: January 16, 2015

Location: UNESCO World Heritage Site, Ancient City of Aleppo

Coordinates:

Site Description: The Tomb of Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan, his wife, brother, and one son are located near the Kiltawiyya Mosque, also known as the historic Madrasa al-Atabakiyya in the Bab al-Hadid area of the Old City. Tabbaa writes³,

From his private funds, Toghril built at least three other religious institutions, an intramural madrasa for the Hanafis, an extramural madrasa for the Hanafis, and a khanaqah near the Bab al-Arba’in. The most important of these was the madrasa al-Atabikiyya of 620/1223, which contains his mausoleum. Today called Jami’ al-Kiltawiyya, it exists in a highly fragmentary state just inside Bab al-Hadid at the northeastern corner of the enclosure. Its foundation inscription, located in the tympanum of a plain vaulted portal ...


Site Date: Parts of the Madrasa Atabikiyya date to 1223 AD. Much of the structure is modern reconstruction and addition. Sheikh Nabhan died in 1974.

Source of Destruction: On January 16, 2015 Jabhat Ansar al-Din, Islamic Front, and Jabhat al-Nusra extremists and local officials, allegedly from the Sharia Court of Aleppo and the Commission for the Promotion of Virtue and the Prevention of Vice destroyed the tomb of Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan and the tombs of his wife and other family members. The attackers then exhumed the human remains, ostensibly for relocation in a cemetery. Printed materials from the school were allegedly burned. The attackers were in possession of a stamped and dated decree issued by several rebel/Islamist organizations in Aleppo ordering the destruction of tombs deemed inappropriate to Islam and the exhumation of human remains for rebury in cemeteries. Later, on January 18, 2015 the Judicial Office of the Sharia Court in Aleppo publically changed its stance on this incident.

Pattern: Deliberate destructions of Sufi heritage. There has been a noticeable increase in the destruction of graves across Syria by Islamist extremists. The usual, generic justification provided is that such structures are inappropriate to Muslim beliefs.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures:

Sources:

Online Reporting:

DGAM Website: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1570

Scholarly:


Tabbaa, Y. Constructions of Power and Piety in Medieval Aleppo. (The Pennsylvania University Press).
The destruction of tombs in the Kiltiwiyya Mosque (APSA).
The destruction of tombs in the Kiltiwiyya Mosque (APSA).
The exhumation of the physical remains of the Sufi Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan and his family from the tombs of the Kiltiwiyya Mosque (APSA).
The exhumation of the physical remains of the Sufi Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan and his family from the tombs of the Kiltiwiyya Mosque (APSA).
The exhumation of the physical remains of the Sufi Sheikh Mohammad Nabhan and his family from the tombs of the Kiltiwiyya Mosque (APSA).
SHI 15-010

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya, Aleppo

Dates of Incidents: The structure has suffered combat damage on multiple occasions. The minaret was hit by artillery October 29, 2012. The great dome was hit twice in November 2012 (one incident was documented on November 25, 2012). Two further bombardments occurred October 20 and December 10, 2013.

Location: UNESCO World Heritage Site, Ancient City of Aleppo

Coordinates:

Site Description: APSA and ASOR CHI produced a report of damage sustained to the madrasa to date. Gaube and Wirth record that this is the largest Ottoman Period madrasa in the city. The structure was built between 1730 and 1738.

Ross Burns writes5,

The Madrasa al-Othmaniya is located in the northern Bab al-Nasr district of Aleppo's old city. It was established by Ottoman Pasha Al-Duraki in 1730 and was originally named Madrasa Rida’iya. The madrasa, which includes a mosque, boasts one of the tallest minarets in Aleppo, built in the traditional Ottoman pencil-shaped style. It is centered on a large courtyard with small garden plots. Two iwans and a prayer hall covered with domes grace the northern and southern sides of the courtyard. This madrasa was an active institution for religious studies in the eighteenth century with the forty-two cells that line the eastern and western sides of the large courtyard. The northern part of the madrasa was demolished in the mid-twentieth century during the construction of the east-west axis, Shar‘i al-Sijn (Prison Street).

Site Date: Ottoman Period (18th Century)


Pattern: Combat damage in the UNESCO World Heritage Site, Ancient City of Aleppo.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: ASOR CHI has already designated the Old City of Aleppo as a high priority for monitoring and remediation efforts.

Sources:

Online Reporting:
APSA Website includes numerous photos and two videos:

Scholarly:
ASORCHI bibliography: Gaube 1978 Nr. 23–27; Gazzi II: 157–173; Rosseau Map 1825 No. 135; Sauvaget 1930 Nr. 73; Sauvaget 1941: Pl. LXVIII and LXIX.

Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo showing areas of combat damage (APSA).
Plan of the Madrasa al-ʿUtmaniya in Aleppo showing areas of combat damage (APSA).

Modern signage at the Madrasa al-ʿUtmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Before- and after-photos of the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).

Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Before- and after-photos of combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-ʿUtmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).

The Madrasa al-ʿUtmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).

Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
The Madrasa al-ʻUtmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).

Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-ʻUtmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-‘Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
Combat damage sustained to the Madrasa al-'Utmaniya in Aleppo (APSA).
SHI 15-011

Report Date: January 18, 2015

Site Name: Sufi Maqam, al-Huqef

Dates of Incidents: December 22, 2014

Location: al-Huqef village in Suweida Governorate

Coordinates:

Site Description: The photos show a small modern structure.

Site Date: Modern

Source of Destruction: ISIL deliberate destruction. The destruction was featured on ISIL websites and on affiliated social media.

Pattern: The deliberate destruction of Sufi heritage by ISIL.

Monitoring Recommendations and Mitigation Measures: —

Sources:

Online Reporting: APSA Website:

Scholarly:
The destruction of a Sufi mausoleum (maqam) in Al-Huqaf (APSA).
The destruction of a Sufi mausoleum (*maqam*) in Al-Huqf (APSA).

Interior of the Sufi mausoleum (*maqam*) in Al-Huqf (APSA).